On minimality and positivity for second-order holonomic sequences

George Kenison

Oleksiy Klurman Engel Lefaucheux Florian Luca Pieter Moree Joël Ouaknine Markus Whiteland James Worrell Technical University of Vienna University of Bristol MPI Software Systems University of the Witwatersrand MPI Mathematics MPI Software Systems MPI Software Systems University of Oxford

classes of recurrence sequences¹



¹see Kauers and Paule, 2011

second-order holonomic sequences

Definition

A second-order holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ satisfies a polynomial recurrence relation

$$p_3(n)u_n = p_2(n)u_{n-1} + p_1(n)u_{n-2}$$

for each $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Here $p_1, p_2, p_3 \in \mathbb{Q}[n]$ and $p_1(n), p_3(n) \neq 0$.

Examples

second-order holonomic sequences

Definition

A second-order holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ satisfies a polynomial recurrence relation

$$p_3(n)u_n = p_2(n)u_{n-1} + p_1(n)u_{n-2}$$

for each $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Here $p_1, p_2, p_3 \in \mathbb{Q}[n]$ and $p_1(n), p_3(n) \neq 0$.

Examples

• Fibonacci's sequence satisfies $u_n = u_{n-1} + u_{n-2}$.

second-order holonomic sequences

Definition

A second-order holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ satisfies a polynomial recurrence relation

$$p_3(n)u_n = p_2(n)u_{n-1} + p_1(n)u_{n-2}$$

for each $n \in \mathbb{N}$. Here $p_1, p_2, p_3 \in \mathbb{Q}[n]$ and $p_1(n), p_3(n) \neq 0$.

Examples

- Fibonacci's sequence satisfies $u_n = u_{n-1} + u_{n-2}$.
- Apéry's sequence $u_n = \sum_{k=0}^n {\binom{n}{k}}^2 {\binom{n+k}{k}}^2$ satisfies

$$n^{3}u_{n} = (34n^{3} - 51n^{2} + 27n - 5)u_{n-1} - (n-1)^{3}u_{n-2}.$$

Definition

A non-trivial holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$

- is minimal if, for every linearly independent solution $\langle v_n \rangle_n$ to the same recurrence, $\lim_{n\to\infty} u_n/v_n = 0$;
- is positive if $u_n \ge 0$ for each n.

Decision Problems

Definition

A non-trivial holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$

- is minimal if, for every linearly independent solution $\langle v_n \rangle_n$ to the same recurrence, $\lim_{n\to\infty} u_n/v_n = 0$;
- is positive if $u_n \ge 0$ for each n.

Decision Problems

Given a holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$, determine whether $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is a

Definition

A non-trivial holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$

- is minimal if, for every linearly independent solution $\langle v_n \rangle_n$ to the same recurrence, $\lim_{n\to\infty} u_n/v_n = 0$;
- is positive if $u_n \ge 0$ for each n.

Decision Problems

Given a holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$, determine whether $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is a

• minimal sequence (the Minimality Problem), or

Definition

A non-trivial holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$

- is minimal if, for every linearly independent solution $\langle v_n \rangle_n$ to the same recurrence, $\lim_{n\to\infty} u_n/v_n = 0$;
- is positive if $u_n \ge 0$ for each n.

Decision Problems

Given a holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$, determine whether $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is a

- minimal sequence (the Minimality Problem), or
- positive sequence (the Positivity Problem).

Fibonacci recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=-1}^{\infty}$ of the Fibonacci recurrence satisfy

 $u_n = u_{n-1} + u_{n-2}.$

Fibonacci recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=-1}^{\infty}$ of the Fibonacci recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = a\phi^n + b(-\phi^{-1})^n.$$

Fibonacci recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=-1}^{\infty}$ of the Fibonacci recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = a\phi^n + b(-\phi^{-1})^n.$$

Here $\phi = (1 + \sqrt{5})/2$ is the golden ratio. The constants *a* and *b* are determined by the initial conditions.

Fibonacci recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=-1}^{\infty}$ of the Fibonacci recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = a\phi^n + b(-\phi^{-1})^n.$$

Here $\phi = (1 + \sqrt{5})/2$ is the golden ratio. The constants *a* and *b* are determined by the initial conditions.

When is $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ a minimal solution?

Fibonacci recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=-1}^{\infty}$ of the Fibonacci recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = a\phi^n + b(-\phi^{-1})^n.$$

Here $\phi = (1 + \sqrt{5})/2$ is the golden ratio. The constants *a* and *b* are determined by the initial conditions.

 $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is minimal precisely when

a = 0

Fibonacci recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=-1}^{\infty}$ of the Fibonacci recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = a\phi^n + b(-\phi^{-1})^n.$$

Here $\phi = (1 + \sqrt{5})/2$ is the golden ratio. The constants *a* and *b* are determined by the initial conditions.

 $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is minimal precisely when

 $u_0/u_{-1} = -\phi^{-1}.$

Apéry recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of the Apéry recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = \frac{34n^3 - 51n^2 + 27n - 5}{n^3}u_{n-1} - \frac{(n-1)^3}{n^3}u_{n-2}.$$

Apéry recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of the Apéry recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = aA_n + bB_n$$

Apéry recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of the Apéry recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = aA_n + bB_n$$

where (canonical solution sequences)

$$\langle A_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 1, 5, 73, 1445, \ldots \rangle$$

 $\langle B_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 0, 6, 351/4, 62531/36, \ldots \rangle.$

Apéry recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of the Apéry recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = aA_n + bB_n$$

where (canonical solution sequences)

$$\langle A_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 1, 5, 73, 1445, \ldots \rangle$$

 $\langle B_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 0, 6, 351/4, 62531/36, \ldots \rangle.$

 $\zeta(3):=\sum_{k=1}^\infty k^{-3}$ is irrational as $\zeta(3)A_n-B_n
ightarrow 0$ quickly.

Apéry recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of the Apéry recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = aA_n + bB_n$$

where (canonical solution sequences)

$$\langle A_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 1, 5, 73, 1445, \ldots \rangle$$

 $\langle B_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 0, 6, 351/4, 62531/36, \ldots \rangle.$

When is $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ a minimal solution?

Apéry recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of the Apéry recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = aA_n + bB_n$$

where (canonical solution sequences)

$$\langle A_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 1, 5, 73, 1445, \ldots \rangle \langle B_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 0, 6, 351/4, 62531/36, \ldots \rangle.$$

Since $\lim_{n\to\infty} \zeta(3)A_n - B_n = 0$, $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is minimal precisely when

 $u_n = c(\zeta(3)A_n - B_n),$

Apéry recurrence

The solutions $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty}$ of the Apéry recurrence satisfy

$$u_n = aA_n + bB_n$$

where (canonical solution sequences)

$$\langle A_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 1, 5, 73, 1445, \ldots \rangle$$

 $\langle B_n \rangle_{n=0}^{\infty} = \langle 0, 6, 351/4, 62531/36, \ldots \rangle.$

Since $\lim_{n\to\infty} \zeta(3)A_n - B_n = 0$, $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is minimal precisely when

 $u_1/u_0 = (5\zeta(3) - 6)/\zeta(3).$

main result

Theorem

Given a second-order polynomial recurrence relation,

There is a subinterval $P \subseteq \mathbb{R}$ such that a non-trivial solution $\langle u_n \rangle_{n=-1}^{\infty}$ is positive if and only if $u_0/u_{-1} \in P$.

We can decide positivity except when u_0/u_{-1} coincides with an endpoint of P.

For second-order holonomic sequences, the Positivity Problem Turing-reduces to the Minimality Problem.





 $\frac{\pi}{4} = \frac{1}{1 + \prod_{j=2}^{\infty} \frac{(2j-3)^2}{2}}$





We employ Gauss' Kettenbruch notation for brevity!

$$\frac{1}{1 + \prod_{j=2}^{\infty} \frac{(2j-3)^2}{2}}$$

Recursively define $\langle A_n \rangle_n$ and $\langle B_n \rangle_n$ with $A_0 = 0, A_1 = 1, B_0 = 1, B_1 = 1$, and for $n \ge 2$

$$A_n = 2A_{n-1} + (2n-3)^2A_{n-2};$$
 and

 $B_n = 2B_{n-1} + (2n-3)^2 B_{n-2}.$

$$\frac{1}{1 + \prod_{j=2}^{\infty} \frac{(2j-3)^2}{2}}$$

Recursively define $\langle A_n \rangle_n$ and $\langle B_n \rangle_n$ with $A_0 = 0, A_1 = 1, B_0 = 1, B_1 = 1$, and for $n \ge 2$

$$A_n = (2n-1)A_{n-1} + (-1)^{n-1}(2n-3)!!;$$
 and

 $B_n = (2n-1)!!.$

(Here $(2n-1)!! := (2n-1)(2n-3)\cdots 3\cdot 1$.)

$$\frac{1}{1 + \prod_{j=2}^{\infty} \frac{(2j-3)^2}{2}}$$

Recursively define $\langle A_n \rangle_n$ and $\langle B_n \rangle_n$ with $A_0 = 0, A_1 = 1, B_0 = 1, B_1 = 1$, and for $n \ge 2$

$$A_n = (2n-1)!! \left(1 - \frac{1}{3} + \dots + \frac{(-1)^{n-1}}{2n-1}\right);$$
 and
 $B_n = (2n-1)!!.$

(Here $(2n-1)!! := (2n-1)(2n-3)\cdots 3\cdot 1$.)

$$\frac{1}{1 + \prod_{j=2}^{\infty} \frac{(2j-3)^2}{2}}$$

Recursively define $\langle A_n \rangle_n$ and $\langle B_n \rangle_n$ with $A_0 = 0, A_1 = 1, B_0 = 1, B_1 = 1$, and for $n \ge 2$

$$A_n = (2n-1)!! \sum_{k=1}^n \frac{(-1)^{k-1}}{2k-1};$$
 and $B_n = (2n-1)!!.$

(Here $(2n-1)!! := (2n-1)(2n-3)\cdots 3\cdot 1$.)

A_n and B_n are (resp.) the numerator and denominator of the *n*th approximant.

$$\frac{1}{1 + \prod_{j=2}^{n} \frac{(2j-3)^2}{2}} = \frac{A_n}{B_n}$$



A_n and B_n are (resp.) the numerator and denominator of the *n*th approximant.

$$\frac{1}{1+\prod_{j=2}^{n}\frac{(2j-3)^2}{2}} = \frac{A_n}{B_n} = \sum_{k=1}^{n}\frac{(-1)^{k-1}}{2k-1}$$



A_n and B_n are (resp.) the numerator and denominator of the *n*th approximant.

$$\frac{1}{1 + \prod_{j=2}^{n} \frac{(2j-3)^2}{2}} = \frac{A_n}{B_n} = \sum_{k=1}^{n} \frac{(-1)^{k-1}}{2k-1}$$

and so in the limit as $n \to \infty$

$$rac{1}{1+\displaystyle \prod_{j=2}^{\infty} rac{(2j-3)^2}{2}} = \arctan(1) = rac{\pi}{4}.$$



We normalise a second-order holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ to obtain $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ given by

We normalise a second-order holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ to obtain $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ given by

 $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$

where κ_n is a rational function.

We normalise a second-order holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ to obtain $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ given by

 $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$

where κ_n is a rational function.

For the purpose of this talk assume that $\kappa_n < 0$ and so

We normalise a second-order holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ to obtain $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ given by

 $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$

where κ_n is a rational function.

For the purpose of this talk assume that $\kappa_n < 0$ and so

• $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ is minimal if and only if $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is minimal, and

We normalise a second-order holonomic sequence $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ to obtain $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ given by

 $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$

where κ_n is a rational function.

For the purpose of this talk assume that $\kappa_n < 0$ and so

- $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ is minimal if and only if $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is minimal, and
- $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ is positive if and only if $\langle u_n \rangle_n$ is positive.

Pincherle's Theorem

Theorem (Pincherle, 1894) The recurrence $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$ admits a minimal solution if and only if $K_{n=1}^{\infty}(\kappa_n/1)$ converges.

Further, if $\langle w_n \rangle_{n=-1}^{\infty}$ is a minimal solution then $-w_0/w_{-1} = K_{n=1}^{\infty}(\kappa_n/1).$

Worpitzky's Theorem

Theorem (Generalised Worpitzky²) $K_{n=1}^{\infty}(\kappa_n/1)$ converges if and only if, either

•
$$0>\lim_{n
ightarrow\infty}\kappa_n>-1/4$$
, or

•
$$\lim_{n\to\infty} \kappa_n = -1/4$$
 and eventually

$$\kappa_n \ge -1/4 - 1/(4n)^2 - 1/(4n\log n)^2$$

²Jacobsen and Masson, 1990

³Lorentzen and Waadeland, 2008, §3.2.4 the Śleszyński–Pringsheim Theorem.

Worpitzky's Theorem

Theorem (Generalised Worpitzky²) $K_{n=1}^{\infty}(\kappa_n/1)$ converges if and only if, either

•
$$0>\lim_{n
ightarrow\infty}\kappa_n>-1/4$$
, or

•
$$\lim_{n\to\infty} \kappa_n = -1/4$$
 and eventually
 $\kappa_n \ge -1/4 - 1/(4n)^2 - 1/(4n\log n)^2$.

If one of the above holds then³

- $\langle A_n/B_n \rangle_n$ strictly decreases and converges to a finite value
- $B_n > 0$ for each $n \in \mathbb{N}$.

²Jacobsen and Masson, 1990

³Lorentzen and Waadeland, 2008, §3.2.4 the Śleszyński–Pringsheim Theorem.

when is $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ positive?

Set $w_{-1}, w_0 \ge 0$. For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, $w_n \ge 0$ if and only if

when is $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ positive?

Set $w_{-1}, w_0 \ge 0$. For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, $w_n \ge 0$ if and only if

$$w_n = w_{-1}A_n + w_0B_n \ge 0$$
$$A_n/B_n \ge -w_0/w_{-1}.$$

when is $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ positive?

Set $w_{-1}, w_0 \ge 0$. For $n \in \mathbb{N}$, $w_n \ge 0$ if and only if

$$w_n = w_{-1}A_n + w_0B_n \ge 0$$

 $A_n/B_n \ge -w_0/w_{-1}$

Hence the non-trivial sequence $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ is positive if and only if $-w_0/w_{-1} \leq K_{n=1}^{\infty}(\kappa_n/1)$.

Let $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ be a solution of $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$.

Let $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ be a solution of $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$. Task: detect when $-w_0/w_{-1} < K_{n=1}^{\infty}(\kappa_n/1)$. solution: study behaviour of $\langle w_n/w_{n-1} \rangle_n$.

Let $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ be a solution of $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$. Task: detect when $-w_0/w_{-1} < K_{n=1}^{\infty}(\kappa_n/1)$. solution: study behaviour of $\langle w_n/w_{n-1} \rangle_n$.

• If $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ is a non-trivial solution then, for each n

$$-w_n/w_{n-1}\in \hat{\mathbb{R}}:=\mathbb{R}\cup\{\infty\}.$$

• If $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ is positive then $-w_n/w_{n-1} < 0$ for each n.

$$-w_n/w_{n-1} = -1 + \frac{\kappa_n}{-w_{n-1}/w_{n-2}}$$

Let $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ be a solution of $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$.

Task: For second-order holonomic sequences, the Positivity Problem Turing-reduces to the Minimality Problem.

Let $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ be a solution of $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$.

Task: For second-order holonomic sequences, the Positivity Problem Turing-reduces to Equality Testing here decidability is an open problem:

Let $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ be a solution of $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$.

Task: For second-order holonomic sequences, the Positivity Problem Turing-reduces to Equality Testing here decidability is an open problem:

$$-w_0/w_{-1} \stackrel{?}{=} \underset{n=1}{\overset{\infty}{\operatorname{K}}} (\kappa_n/1).$$

For $\langle w_n \rangle_n$ a solution to $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa_n w_{n-2}$,

$$-w_0/w_{-1} \stackrel{?}{=} \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \kappa_n/1$$

$$-u_0/u_{-1} \stackrel{?}{=} \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{p(n)}{q(n)}$$

$$u_0/u_{-1} \stackrel{?}{=} \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{p(n)}{q(n)}$$
$$\phi = 1 + \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{1/1}$$
$$\frac{\pi}{4} = \frac{1}{1 + \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{(2n+1)^2}{2}}$$

$$u_0/u_{-1} \stackrel{?}{=} \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{p(n)}{q(n)}$$

$$\phi = 1 + \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{1}{1}$$

$$\frac{\pi}{4} = \frac{1}{1 + \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{(2n+1)^2}{2}}$$

$$\zeta(3) = \frac{6}{5 + \prod_{n=1}^{\infty} \frac{-n^6}{34n^3 + 51n^2 + 27n + 5}}$$

Definition (Kontsevich and Zagier, 2001)

$$\int_D g(x_1,\ldots,x_k)\,dx_1\cdots dx_k$$

Definition (Kontsevich and Zagier, 2001)

$$\int_D g(x_1,\ldots,x_k)\,dx_1\cdots dx_k$$

Definition (Kontsevich and Zagier, 2001)

$$\int_D g(x_1,\ldots,x_k)\,dx_1\cdots dx_k.$$

$$\overline{\mathbb{Q}}, \quad \pi = \int_0^\infty \frac{2}{x^2 + 1} \, dx,$$

Definition (Kontsevich and Zagier, 2001)

$$\int_D g(x_1,\ldots,x_k)\,dx_1\cdots dx_k.$$

$$\overline{\mathbb{Q}}, \quad \pi = \int_0^\infty \frac{2}{x^2 + 1} \, dx, \quad B(\alpha, \beta) = \int_0^1 x^\alpha (1 - x)^\beta \, dx.$$

equality between periods

Conjecture (Kontsevich and Zagier, 2001) *It is decidable whether two periods are equal.*

equality between periods

Conjecture (Kontsevich and Zagier, 2001) *It is decidable whether two periods are equal.*

Theorem

For second-order degree-1 holonomic sequences, the Positivity and Minimality Problems reduce to determining equality between (generalisations of) periods.

equality between periods

Conjecture (Kontsevich and Zagier, 2001) *It is decidable whether two periods are equal.*

Theorem

For second-order degree-1 holonomic sequences, the Positivity and Minimality Problems reduce to determining equality between (generalisations of) periods.

Proof (Idea).

Study the convergence properties of the generating function whose coefficient sequence is minimal. $\hfill \Box$

Thank you!

intuition

Behaviour of $\langle w_n/w_{n-1}\rangle_n$ when $\langle w_n\rangle_n$ is minimal.



Let $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa w_{n-1}$. Figure shows invariant lines for $\langle w_n/w_{n-1} \rangle_n$ with $\kappa < -1/4$.

intuition

Behaviour of $\langle w_n/w_{n-1}\rangle_n$ when $\langle w_n\rangle_n$ is minimal.



Let $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa w_{n-1}$. Figure shows invariant lines for $\langle w_n/w_{n-1} \rangle_n$ with $\kappa = -1/4$.

intuition

Behaviour of $\langle w_n/w_{n-1}\rangle_n$ when $\langle w_n\rangle_n$ is minimal.



Let $w_n = w_{n-1} + \kappa w_{n-1}$. Figure shows invariant lines for $\langle w_n/w_{n-1} \rangle_n$ with $\kappa > -1/4$.

references i

L. Jacobsen and D. R. Masson. "On the convergence of limit periodic continued fractions $K(a_n/1)$, where $a_n \rightarrow -\frac{1}{4}$. III". In: *Constr. Approx.* 6.4 (1990), 363–374.



Manuel Kauers and Peter Paule. *The concrete tetrahedron*. Texts and Monographs in Symbolic Computation. Symbolic sums, recurrence equations, generating functions, asymptotic estimates. SpringerWienNewYork, Vienna, 2011, pp. x+203.

Maxim Kontsevich and Don Zagier. "Periods". In: Mathematics unlimited—2001 and beyond. Springer, Berlin, 2001, 771–808.

references ii

- Lisa Lorentzen and Haakon Waadeland. Continued fractions. Vol. 1. Second. Vol. 1. Atlantis Studies in Mathematics for Engineering and Science. Atlantis Press, Paris; World Scientific Publishing Co. Pte. Ltd., Hackensack, NJ, 2008, pp. xii+308.
- Salvatore Pincherle. "Delle Funzioni ipergeometriche, e di varie questioni ad esse attinenti". In: *Giorn. Mat. Battaglini* 32 (1894), 209–291.